

PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE
23 April 2015

Item No:

UPRN

APPLICATION NO.

DATE VALID

15/P0081

23/12//2014

Address/Site 143 Cottenham Park Road, West Wimbledon, SW20 0DW

(Ward) Raynes Park

Proposal: Demolition of existing detached dwelling house and erection of a new detached dwelling house with associated parking and landscaping

Drawing Nos FA.R14-17 A – 105E, 107E, 108E, 109E, 110E, 111D, 112D, 113D, 114E, 115E, 116C, 118B; sustainability statement.

Contact Officer: Mark Brodie (8545 4028)

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT Planning Permission subject to conditions

CHECKLIST INFORMATION

- Heads of agreement: No
- Is a screening opinion required: No
- Is an Environmental impact statement required: No
- Has an Environmental Impact Assessment been submitted: No
- Press notice- Yes
- Site notice-Yes
- Design Review Panel consulted-No
- Number neighbours consulted – 12
- External consultants: None
- Density: 154 h.r.p.h
- Number of jobs created: n/a
- Archaeology Priority Zone: No

1. **INTRODUCTION**

- 1.1 This application has been brought to the Planning Applications Committee due to the number of objections.

2. **SITE AND SURROUNDINGS**

- 2.1 The application site comprises a detached two storey, three bedroom single family dwelling house located on the south side of Cottenham Park Road, west of and close to the junction with Oakwood Road. Cottenham Park Road is a well-established residential road comprising a mixture of mainly detached and some semi-detached and terraced residential properties, of varying sizes and designs. To the west fronting onto Oakwood Road are a pair of two-storey semi-detached properties and to the east lies a recently constructed part two/part three-storey detached house fronting onto Cottenham Park Road. Opposite across Cottenham Park Road is a playing field that lies within Corpse Hill Conservation Area and designated Open Land (MOL).
- 2.2 The site is not within a conservation area or an area at risk of flooding. There are no TPO'd trees and the site does not lie within an Archaeological Priority Area. Public Transport Accessibility Level is low (PTAL 1b).

3. **CURRENT PROPOSAL**

- 3.1 The current scheme involves the demolition of the existing detached house and the erection of a new two-storey (with rooms within roof space) detached dwelling house with associated car parking and landscaping. The proposed plans indicate a layout that comprises living room, family room, dining room and kitchen at ground floor level with three bedrooms at first floor level and two bedrooms at second floor level. All bedrooms would host an en-suite bathroom.
- 3.2 The proposed house would be 10 metres in width and 15 metres deep at ground floor level narrowing to 12.7m at first floor level. The house would be set off the boundary with properties in Oakwood Road by approximately 1.2 metres and 0.5 metres from the boundary with no.141 Cottenham Park Road to the east. The proposed house would have an eaves height of 5 metres and a ridge height of 7.6 metres. The proposed house would be set some 6.5 metres from the front building line.
- 3.3 A traditional design approach has been adopted for the proposed dwelling, which would be constructed in facing London stock brickwork, painted hardwood sash windows with stone cills and soldier course, a pitched slate roof with flat roof dormers to front and rear. At the front it is proposed to have two two-storey splayed gabled bays. It is proposed to lay out a new driveway and parking area accommodating up to three cars and to landscape the front curtilage.
- 3.4 The application has been the subject of amendment and the submission of further information. The main change involves a reduction in the overall height of the building by approximately 250mm. The applicant has submitted a sustainability statement; clarified the relationship with buildings in Oakwood

Road and provided additional/revised sun studies showing effect on shading upon 141 Cottenham Park Road and to 18a Oakwood Road.

4. **PLANNING HISTORY**

- 4.1 MER343/71 Extensions to provide a new garage, lobby, laundry area and reception room on ground floor, with bathroom and additional bedroom on first floor.
- 4.2 02/2762 Erection of a two-storey front extension, part one/part two-storey side extension and rear dormer roof extension.
- 4.3 07/P1475 Certificate of Lawfulness in respect of the demolition and rebuilding of a single-storey side extension.

5. **CONSULTATION**

- 5.1 The application has been advertised by site & press notice procedure and letters of notification to occupiers of 12 neighbouring properties. 5 objections and two letters of support have been received.
- 5.2 (no.139 Cottenham Park Road) increased ridge height relative to the neighbouring houses and increased footprint would be extremely imposing, bulky design dwarfs surrounding houses; the appearance of the front elevation represents a sore thumb; preference for a similar design to the approved scheme that was negotiated at no.141.
- 5.3 (nos. 18 & 18a Oakwood Road): proposal is overbearing and detrimental to the enjoyment of properties; no sun study has been carried out to gauge effect on nos.18 and 18a; at first floor level the proposed building will project considerably further than the existing building resulting in an overbearing mass of solid brickwork & overshadowing; the document described as proposed visuals is totally out of scale showing a large gap adjacent to no.18a whereas at its narrowest point is less than 75cm; increase sense of enclosure and loss of light; would break the building line.
- 5.4 (no.16 Oakwood Road): out of date plans of neighbouring properties that have been subsequently extended; the gap between 18 & 18a Oakwood Road is shown incorrectly and not as large as shown; the orangerie is likely to result in an increased sense of enclosure and loss of privacy; preference for orangerie to be reduced in depth so as no to exceed the boundary with nos. 18 & 18a Oakwood Road. .
- 5.5 Wimbledon Society: Objects on the following grounds: Footprint of the new house is in front of existing building lines and is much taller and wider than the existing house and would dominate the surrounding buildings & fail to relate positively to its neighbours contrary to Policy DMD2A; fails to provide information relating to sustainability contrary to policy DMH4.

- 5.6 The Resident's Association of West Wimbledon: Extends footprint to the north and south beyond the existing building lines; the increased mass and height of the proposed new house would result in a structure that is out of context with its setting and would be excessively dominant to the street scene and would result in overshadowing of the neighbouring property and garden at no.141, contrary to policy DMD2a; the application contains no statement that it will comply Sustainable Homes Level 5 contrary to Policy DMH4; the scheme involves five bedrooms each with en-suite bathrooms, none of which have natural ventilation to the bathrooms; the single aspect bedrooms have poor access to natural light; the proposed building would dominate open views across the site and detract from views of the Metropolitan Open Land opposite; .
- 5.7 2 letters of support. One from adjacent property at no. 141 & one from no. 79 Cottenham Park Road: proposal would significantly improve the street scene and outlook of surroundings; would represent a significant improvement on the current building improving the appearance of the road; do not consider the proposed house would negatively impact on own house; No.143 is almost the last house on the street which has not benefited from redevelopment; the proposal would allow the property to better fit in with the rest of the street; proposed redevelopment would be in keeping with recent building works which has improved the appearance of the houses in this part of the road. .

6. **POLICY CONTEXT**

- 6.1 Merton Core Strategy (July 2011)
CS 8 (Housing Choice), CS13 (Open Space, Nature Conservation, Leisure and Culture), CS14 (Design), CS15 (Climate Change) and CS20 (Parking)
- 6.2 Merton Sites and Policies Plan (July 2014)
DM H2 (Housing Mix), DM H4 (Demolition and Redevelopment of a Single Dwelling House), DM 02 (Nature Conservation, Trees, Hedges and Landscape Features), DM D2 (Design Considerations in all Developments) and DM T3 (Car Parking and Servicing Standards).
- 6.3 The London Plan (March 2015)
The relevant policies within the London Plan are 3.3 (Increasing Housing Supply), 3.5 (Quality and Design of Housing), 3.8 (Housing Choice), 3.11 (Affordable Housing), 4.3 (Mixed Use Development and Offices), 5.7 (Renewable Energy), 7.4 (Local Character), 7.6 (Architecture).

7. **PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS**

- 7.1 The main planning considerations concern the demolition of the existing house, the design and standard of accommodation of the new dwelling and its impact on the neighbouring conservation area and Metropolitan Open Land, together with neighbour amenity, parking and sustainability issues.

Demolition of Existing Building

- 7.2 The existing dwelling house is of little architectural merit and there are no objections to the demolition of the existing building subject to a satisfactory replacement and compliance with relevant adopted Merton Core strategy policies and policies within the Merton Plans and Policies Plan in particular policy DM H4 (Demolition and Redevelopment of a Single Dwelling House) and policies within the London Plan and relevant planning guidance.

Design Issues

- 7.3 A traditional design approach has been adopted for the proposed new dwelling house and the position of the proposed house within the plot and its relationship with neighbouring properties is considered to be acceptable in design terms. The proposed house replicates elements of the design of other replacement houses that have been approved at nos. 125, 127 and 129 Cottenham Park Road. It would be constructed in brick incorporating features common to the townscape including bays, dormers and chimneys. There is no uniformity of appearance within the road. The amended roof height would be marginally higher than the neighbouring property to the east (no.141) by approximately 600mm. There are comparable differences in heights between the two properties at no.137 and 139 with greater differences in height between 125/127 and 129 & 131 of 1.5m and 1.7m respectively. In the context of the streetscene the proposed height and bulk of the proposed house is considered acceptable.

Impact on MOL/Conservation Area

- 7.4 This section of Cottenham Park Road lies due south of an open sports land that was formerly associated with Atkinson Morley/St Georges Hospital. The land is designated as MOL and lies within Corpse Hill Conservation Area. A row of mature trees borders the sports land where it meets Cottenham Park Road. Policy DM 01 seeks to ensure that development of land outside the boundaries of MOL, but in proximity to it, must not adversely affect the amenity, quality or utility of the open space. Policy DM04 requires development adjacent to a conservation area to preserve or enhance the setting and not detract from views into or out of the area. It is acknowledged that the design and scale of the proposed buildings would differ from its older neighbours, however, the proposed replacement house would not materially alter the backdrop of the MOL when viewed in the context of recently constructed houses in this stretch of Cottenham Park Road. The proposed house being similar in design to other recent developments along this part of Cottenham Park Road would not detract unacceptably from and would generally preserve the character and appearance of the Corpse Hill Conservation Area opposite.

Standard of Residential Accommodation – Lifetime Homes Standards

- 7.5 The London Plan sets out minimum space standards (Table 3.3) and policy 3.5 indicates that the Mayor will, and borough should, seek to ensure that developments reflect these standards. Policy CS.8 of the LDF requires all housing to be built to lifetime homes standards.

7.6 London Plan policy 3.5 also requires that new dwellings have adequately sized rooms and convenient and efficient room layouts, meet the changing needs of Londoners over their lifetimes, and address social inclusion objectives. This policy also sets out the minimum Gross Internal Areas required for different sized residential properties. The gross internal area of the proposed house more than complies with minimum space standards set out in the London Plan 2015 and all the rooms have good levels of outlook and natural light. The rear garden remains in excess of the minimum 50 sq.m required for a new house.

7.7 Policies in the London Plan and Core Strategy require that all new residential properties be built to Lifetime Home Standards. The applicant has confirmed compliance with Lifetime Home Standards. A planning condition is recommended to ensure prior to first occupation of the new dwelling, written evidence shall be submitted confirming the new dwelling meets the relevant criteria of Lifetime Homes Standards.

Neighbour Amenity

7.8 Policy DM D2 in the Council's Sites and Policies Plan seeks to ensure appropriate levels of sunlight and daylight, quality of living conditions and privacy to adjoining buildings and gardens. In the recognition of the potential for the proposed house to affect the outlook and light for the occupiers of no.141 Cottenham Park Road, to the rear at first floor level, its eastern flank wall has been set in 3.9m for a projection of 2.4m. The submitted sun study shows that the effect of shading on no.141 would not be significant. Overall the scheme should not give rise to unacceptable loss of outlook, sunlight and daylight to this neighbouring property. Given the juxtaposition of the properties to the west in Oakwood Road, the proposed house would not have a significant impact on the sunlight/daylight currently enjoyed by occupiers of these properties over and above that currently experienced from the existing property which is positioned approximately 300mm closer to this boundary than the proposed house. The applicant has provided a sun study that shows that the scheme would not give rise to unacceptable loss of sunlight to these properties.

7.9 Suitably conditioned to ensure that the roof of the proposed single-storey rear addition is not used a roof terrace will prevent the potential for overlooking and loss of privacy to neighbouring properties. There are no windows currently proposed within each flank (side) elevation of the proposed house. Suitably conditioned to ensure no windows are installed within the flank walls of the house should protect neighbour's privacy and prevent direct overlooking. The proposed single-storey rear extension is set some 1.5m from the garden boundary with no.16 Oakwood Road and it is not considered that this relationship would result in an unacceptable increased sense of enclosure or loss of privacy to occupiers of this property.

Trees

- 7.10 No trees would be lost as a result of the proposed redevelopment.

Parking

- 7.11 Three parking spaces would be provided within the front forecourt which is considered acceptable in terms of policy CS20.

8. Developer Contributions

- 8.1 The proposed development would also be subject to payment of the Merton Community Infrastructure Levy and the Mayor of London's Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL).

9. SUSTAINABILITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT REQUIREMENTS

- 9.1 The proposal does not constitute Schedule 1 or Schedule 2 development. Accordingly there is no requirement for an EIA submission.
- 9.2 Policy DM H4 (Demolition and Redevelopment of a Single Dwelling House) seeks to promote sustainable development and effective use of resources. The policy states that where a proposal involves the demolition of a structurally sound dwelling house to create a new dwelling in its place, the new dwelling would be required to demonstrate that it would have exceeded the minimum sustainability requirements outlined in Merton's Core Planning Strategy 2011 policy CS15 through:(a) Limiting CO2 emissions from the operation of the dwelling and its services in line with Code for sustainable homes level 5;(b) Improving the fabric energy efficiency performance in line with Code for sustainable Homes level 5; and,(c) Making effective use of resources and materials in accordance with Merton's Core Planning Strategy Policy CS15 (part (a)). Suitable conditions may be attached to meet these objectives.

10. CONCLUSION

- 10.1 The design of the proposed house, standard of accommodation, its impact on the neighbouring conservation area and Metropolitan Open Land, together with neighbour amenity, parking and sustainability issues are considered acceptable. Accordingly it is recommended that planning be granted..

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT PLANNING PERMISSION

and subject to the following conditions:-

1. A.1 Commencement of Development
2. A.7 Approved Drawings

3. B.1 (Approval of Facing Materials)
4. B.4 (Site Surface Treatment)
5. B.5 (Boundary Treatment)
6. C.2 (No Permitted Development Doors/Windows)
7. C.1 (No permitted development Extensions)
8. C.7 (Refuse and Recycling-Implementation)
9. C8 (No use of flat roof)
10. D.11 (Construction Times)
11. H.9 Construction Vehicles)
12. J.1 (Lifetime Homes)
13. L.2 (Code for Sustainable Homes-Pre Commencement)
14. L.3 (Code for Sustainable Homes – Pre Occupation)
15. INF.1 Party Wall Act
16. INF.7 Hardstandings